

Susan E. Coleman (SBN 171832)
E-mail: scoleman@bwsllaw.com
BURKE, WILLIAMS & SORESENSEN, LLP
444 South Flower Street, 40th Floor
Los Angeles, California 90071-2942
Tel: 213.236.0600 Fax: 213.236.2700

Attorneys for Defendant CALEB GARCIA ALAMILLA

HYDEE FELDSTEIN SOTO, City Attorney (SBN 106866)
DENISE C. MILLS, Chief Deputy City Attorney (SBN 191992)
KATHLEEN KENEALY, Chief Assistant City Attorney (SBN 212289)
TY A. FORD, Deputy City Attorney (SBN 218365)
200 North Main Street, 6th Floor, City Hall East
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Tel: 213.978.6900 Fax: 213.978.8785
Email: Ty.Ford@lacity.org

Attorneys for Defendant CITY OF LOS
ANGELES

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION

ALEXANDRA RASEY-SMITH;
GORDON GENE MACCANI; and
JANET MACCANI,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES; CALEB
GARCIA ALAMILLA; and DOES 2-
10, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 2:24-cv-03265-MWC-SSC

**DEFENDANTS' SEPARATE
STATEMENT OF
UNCONTROVERTED FACTS AND
CONCLUSIONS OF LAW IN
SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS'
MOTION FOR PARTIAL
SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

*Filed concurrently with Motion for
Partial Summary Judgment;
Declaration of C. Garcia Alamilla;
Declaration of C. Chomuk; and
[Proposed] Order*

Judge: Hon. Michelle Williams Court
Date: December 26, 2025
Time: 1:30 p.m.
Ctrm.: 6A

Trial Date: April 6, 2026

///

Defendants hereby submit this Separate Statement of Uncontroverted Facts and Conclusions of Law together with references to evidence in support of Defendants' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment:

UNCONTROVERTED FACTS & SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Defs' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
1.	On February 3, 2024, at approximately 2:20 p.m., Los Angeles Police Department received a call for service regarding an assault with a deadly weapon in progress at a studio in an industrial complex in the Skid Row area of downtown Los Angeles.	Garcia Decl. ¶¶ 2–3; Chomuk Decl. ¶¶ 2–3
2.	The caller reported the suspect was an adult white male who was under the influence and armed with a large stick attacking an employee.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 4
3.	Dispatch instructed the officers to respond Code 3—an emergency response requiring immediate action.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 5
4.	Police Officers Garcia and Colin Chomuk responded Code 3.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 8
5.	While enroute to the location, dispatch provided additional information—that the suspect was on the fourth floor, guarding the door to the studio and preventing the reporting party from exiting.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 6

1 2 3 4 5 6 7	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28
Defs' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
6.	Reading aloud from the patrol vehicle's CAD system, Officer Chomuk read the description of the suspect as male, white, six-feet-two-inches tall, and armed with stick threatening employees.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 7
7.	Officers Garcia and Chomuk arrived at the location along with four other officers and a Sergeant.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 8
8.	As Officers Garcia and Chomuk pulled up to the location, one of the reporting parties met them outside.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 9
9.	They followed him into the building where they met with both reporting parties, who explained that a stranger (later identified as Jason Maccani) had opened the unlocked door to their work studio, entered, and began ordering them to leave in an aggressive and erratic manner.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 9
10.	They told officers they believed he was under the influence of drugs.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 9
11.	They informed the responding officers that they wanted the intruder removed, and signed a private-persons-arrest form authorizing them to arrest the intruder for trespass.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 10
12.	The reporting parties provided responding officers with a description of the area approaching their studio.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 11

1 2 3 4 5 6 7	8 9 10 11 12 13	14 15 16 17	18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28
Defs' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT	
13.	When asked if there were weapons inside the studio, the reporting parties informed officers that while there were no firearms, the intruder had access to sharp scissors and shears since they were in the textile/fabric industry.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 11	
14.	After the reporting parties signed the private-persons-arrest form, Sergeant Punzalan prepared a tactical plan, designating Officer Orozco as the contact officer, Officers Chomuk and Rodriguez as officers with authority to use less-lethal force, and Officers Quintero and Garcia as the arrest team.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 12	
15.	The responding Officers ascended the stairs to the fourth floor and positioned themselves approximately 35 feet away from the unit, the door of which was ajar.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 13	
16.	Officer Rodriguez issued a callout, announcing the presence of the Los Angeles Police Department and issuing verbal commands for the suspect (Maccani) to exit with his hands raised.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 14	
17.	The photograph accurately depicts the responding officers' positioning outside the studio immediately prior to Officer Rodriguez's callout.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 15	
18.	Within a few seconds of the callout, Maccani appeared in the doorway of the studio with his hands raised.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 16	

1 2 3 4	5 6 7 8	9 10 11 12	13 14 15	16 17 18 19	20 21 22 23 24 25
1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12
13	14	15	16	17	18
19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29	30
31	32	33	34	35	36
37	38	39	40	41	42
43	44	45	46	47	48
49	50	51	52	53	54
55	56	57	58	59	60
61	62	63	64	65	66
67	68	69	70	71	72
73	74	75	76	77	78
79	80	81	82	83	84
85	86	87	88	89	90
91	92	93	94	95	96
97	98	99	100	101	102
103	104	105	106	107	108
109	110	111	112	113	114
115	116	117	118	119	120
121	122	123	124	125	126
127	128	129	130	131	132
133	134	135	136	137	138
139	140	141	142	143	144
145	146	147	148	149	150
151	152	153	154	155	156
157	158	159	160	161	162
163	164	165	166	167	168
169	170	171	172	173	174
175	176	177	178	179	180
181	182	183	184	185	186
187	188	189	190	191	192
193	194	195	196	197	198
199	200	201	202	203	204
205	206	207	208	209	210
211	212	213	214	215	216
217	218	219	220	221	222
223	224	225	226	227	228
229	230	231	232	233	234
235	236	237	238	239	240
241	242	243	244	245	246
247	248	249	250	251	252
253	254	255	256	257	258
259	260	261	262	263	264
265	266	267	268	269	270
271	272	273	274	275	276
277	278	279	280	281	282
283	284	285	286	287	288
289	290	291	292	293	294
295	296	297	298	299	300
301	302	303	304	305	306
307	308	309	310	311	312
313	314	315	316	317	318
319	320	321	322	323	324
325	326	327	328	329	330
331	332	333	334	335	336
337	338	339	340	341	342
343	344	345	346	347	348
349	350	351	352	353	354
355	356	357	358	359	360
361	362	363	364	365	366
367	368	369	370	371	372
373	374	375	376	377	378
379	380	381	382	383	384
385	386	387	388	389	390
391	392	393	394	395	396
397	398	399	400	401	402
403	404	405	406	407	408
409	410	411	412	413	414
415	416	417	418	419	420
421	422	423	424	425	426
427	428	429	430	431	432
433	434	435	436	437	438
439	440	441	442	443	444
445	446	447	448	449	450
451	452	453	454	455	456
457	458	459	460	461	462
463	464	465	466	467	468
469	470	471	472	473	474
475	476	477	478	479	480
481	482	483	484	485	486
487	488	489	490	491	492
493	494	495	496	497	498
499	500	501	502	503	504
505	506	507	508	509	510
511	512	513	514	515	516
517	518	519	520	521	522
523	524	525	526	527	528
529	530	531	532	533	534
535	536	537	538	539	540
541	542	543	544	545	546
547	548	549	550	551	552
553	554	555	556	557	558
559	560	561	562	563	564
565	566	567	568	569	570
571	572	573	574	575	576
577	578	579	580	581	582
583	584	585	586	587	588
589	590	591	592	593	594
595	596	597	598	599	600
601	602	603	604	605	606
607	608	609	610	611	612
613	614	615	616	617	618
619	620	621	622	623	624
625	626	627	628	629	630
631	632	633	634	635	636
637	638	639	640	641	642
643	644	645	646	647	648
649	650	651	652	653	654
655	656	657	658	659	660
661	662	663	664	665	666
667	668	669	670	671	672
673	674	675	676	677	678
679	680	681	682	683	684
685	686	687	688	689	690
691	692	693	694	695	696
697	698	699	700	701	702
703	704	705	706	707	708
709	710	711	712	713	714
715	716	717	718	719	720
721	722	723	724	725	726
727	728	729	730	731	732
733	734	735	736	737	738
739	740	741	742	743	744
745	746	747	748	749	750
751	752	753	754	755	756
757	758	759	760	761	762
763	764	765	766	767	768
769	770	771	772	773	774
775	776	777	778	779	780
781	782	783	784	785	786
787	788	789	790	791	792
793	794	795	796	797	798
799	800	801	802	803	804
805	806	807	808	809	810
811	812	813	814	815	816
817	818	819	820	821	822
823	824	825	826	827	828
829	830	831	832	833	834
835	836	837	838	839	840
841	842	843	844	845	846
847	848	849	850	851	852
853	854	855	856	857	858
859	860	861	862	863	864
865	866	867	868	869	870
871	872	873	874	875	876
877	878	879	880	881	882
883	884	885	886	887	888
889	890	891	892	893	894
895	896	897	898	899	900
901	902	903	904	905	906
907	908	909	910	911	912
913	914	915	916	917	918
919	920	921	922	923	924
925	926	927	928	929	930
931	932	933	934	935	936
937	938	939	940	941	942
943	944	945	946	947	948
949	950	951	952	953	954
955	956	957	958	959	960
961	962	963	964	965	966
967	968	969	970	971	972
973	974	975	976	977	978
979	980	981	982	983	984
985	986	987	988	989	990
991	992	993	994	995	996
997	998	999	1000	1001	1002
1003	1004	1005	1006	1007	1008
1009	1010	1011	1012	1013	1014
1015	1016	1017	1018	1019	1020
1021	1022	1023	1024	1025	1026
1027	1028	1029	1030	1031	1032
1033	1034	1035	1036	1037	1038
1039	1040	1041	1042	1043	1044
1045	1046	1047	1048	1049	1050
1051	1052	1053	1054	1055	1056
1057	1058	1059	1060	1061	1062
1063	1064	1065	1066	1067	1068
1069	1070	1071	1072	1073	1074
1075	1076	1077	1078	1079	1080
1081	1082	1083	1084	1085	1086
1087	1088	1089	1090	1091	1092
1093	1094	1095	1096	1097	1098
1099	1100	1101	1102	1103	1104
1105	1106	1107	1108	1109	1110
1111	1112	1113	1114	1115	1116
1117	1118	1119	1120	1121	1122
1123	1124	1125	1126	1127	1128
1129	1130	1131	1132	1133	1134
1135	1136	1137	1138	1139	1140
1141	1142	1143	1144	1145	1146
1147	1148	1149	1150	1151	1152
1153	1154	1155	1156	1157	1158
1159	1160	1161	1162	1163	1164
1165	1166	1167	1168	1169	1170
1171	1172	1173	1174	1175	1176
1177	1178	1179	1180	1181	1182
1183	1184	1185	1186	1187	1188
1189	1190	1191	1192	1193	1194
1195	1196	1197	1198	1199	1200
1201	1202	1203	1204	1205	1206
1207	1208	1209	1210	1211	1212
1213	1214	1215	1216	1217	1218
1219	1220	1221	1222	1223	1224
1225	1226	1227	1228	1229	1230
1231	1232	1233	1234	1235	1236
1237	1238	1239	1240	1241	1242
1243	1244	1245	1246	1247	1248
1249	1250	1251	1252	1253	1254
1255	1256	1257	1258	1259	1260
1261	1262	1263	1264	1265	1266
1267	1268	1269	1270	1271	1272
1273	1274	1275	1276	1277	1278
1279	1280	1281	1282	1283	1284
1285	1286	1287	1288	1289	1290
1291	1292	1293	1294	1295	1296
1297	1298	1299	1300	1301	1302
1303	1304	1305	1306	1307	1308
1309	1310	1311	1312	1313	1314
1315	1316	1317	1318	1319	1320
1321	1322	1323	1324	1325	1326

Defs' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
25.	As Officer Chomuk fired, Officer Rodriguez simultaneously fired one beanbag round from her Remington 870 shotgun from approximately eight feet away.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 20
26.	The beanbag struck Maccani in the abdomen.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 20
27.	The 40mm foam projectile and beanbag round are less-lethal force options designed to strike the suspect's body and cause pain without penetrating the body, in order to subdue the individual and enable officers to safely gain control.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 21
28.	The Officers' attempts to deescalate and gain compliance using verbal orders and less-lethal force were unsuccessful.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 21
29.	After the 40mm foam projectile and beanbag rounds struck Maccani, he took a fighting stance, clenching both fists and turning his body so that his left side angled towards Officers as he approached them.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 22
30.	He drew his left arm tightly across his body in a guarded fighting stance, while his right hand remained clenched around what appeared to be a pointed object, which he held downward in a striking position.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 22

Defs' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
31.	Officer Garcia Alamilla believed the object clenched in Maccani's right fist was a knife.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 22
32.	Maccani's movements and stance were aggressive and combative, protecting his body with his left arm while approaching Officers as if preparing to strike with the other (as depicted in the photograph above, with the red circle around the object Officer Garcia observed in Maccani's hand).	Garcia Decl. ¶ 23
33.	Maccani began yelling and rapidly and purposefully charged towards the Officers.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 24
34.	As he closed the distance, Officer Rodriguez deployed a second less-lethal beanbag round from less than one foot away.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 24
35.	The beanbag struck Maccani on his right forearm.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 24
36.	This further use of less-lethal force also proved ineffective.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 24
37.	Maccani shrieked and barreled towards the officers.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 25
38.	As he advanced, Officer Garcia again observed Maccani gripping what appeared to be a white knife in his right hand.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 25

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	Def's' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
		39.	Maccani's eyes were wide and fixed on the Officers with an intense, unbroken stare.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 25
		40.	In that moment, Officer Garcia believed Maccani was preparing to use the knife against them.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 25
		41.	Maccani charged towards Officer Rodriguez, using both of his forearms to push her beanbag shotgun in a downward motion.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 26
		42.	Officer Rodriguez's head and back struck the wall as Maccani pushed her, pinning her against the wall.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 26; see also Exs. A and B thereto Chomuk Decl., Ex. A
		43.	Officer Rodriguez immediately pulled the beanbag shotgun away, causing Maccani to collide with his back against the north hallway wall.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 27
		44.	Meanwhile, fearing for the safety of Officer Rodriguez, Officer Garcia unholstered his firearm.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 28
		45.	Sergeant Punzalan then grabbed Maccani's right arm just above the elbow.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 28
		46.	As Sergeant Punzalan placed his right hand on Maccani's right bicep, Officer Garcia raised his pistol and fired one round from approximately three-to-six feet away toward center mass (chest/torso area).	Garcia Decl. ¶ 28

Defs' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
47.	The round struck Maccani in the right upper arm and then his chest.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 29
48.	Maccani screamed loudly but remained upright.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 29
49.	Sergeant Punzalan pushed Maccani to the wall; he and Officer Garcia thereafter took Maccani to the ground and handcuffed him without further incident.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 31
50.	As they were handcuffing Maccani, Officer Garcia verbally confirmed to the other Officers that he had fired a lethal-force round that struck Maccani.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 31
51.	The lethal shot was fired at roughly 14:28:48 in the body-worn-camera footage.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 31
52.	Officers quickly rolled Maccani into a recovery position (on his side) and radioed dispatch to send an ambulance.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 32
53.	Officer Garcia heard one of his fellow officers call for the rescue ambulance at roughly 14:29:57, just over a minute after the lethal shot was fired.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 32
54.	Officer Garcia noticed Maccani had a chest wound after he was rolled into the recovery position and applied pressure to prevent him from bleeding out.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 32
55.	Officer Orozco checked for a pulse on Maccani's neck.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 32

Defs' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
56.	He ordered that chest compressions be initiated, so Officer Garcia rolled Maccani onto his back, and performed chest compressions until another Officer took over.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 33
57.	Los Angeles Fire Department personnel arrived at 14:35 hours and assumed medical care of Maccani, who was later pronounced deceased at the hospital at 15:12 hours.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 33
58.	After Maccani was transported and the scene was processed, it was discovered that the object he had been clenching in his fist was a plastic fork.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 34
59.	Officer Garcia was unaware of this fact until after the shooting.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 34
60.	Surveillance video footage that fairly and accurately depicts the events that occurred in the fourth floor hallway on February 3, 2024 is attached as Exhibit A to Officer Garcia's declaration. The video, which was produced as DEF2520, contains no audio component and appears somewhat distorted as it uses a wide-angle lens.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 35 (erroneously numbered 31 on page 7)

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	9 10 11 12 13 14 15	16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23
Def's' SSUF No.	UNCONTROVERTED FACTS	EVIDENTIARY SUPPORT
61.	The footage from Officer Garcia's body worn camera that fairly and accurately depicts the events that occurred in the fourth floor hallway on February 3, 2024, from the viewpoint of the camera affixed to his chest is attached to his declaration as Exhibit B . It was produced as DEF2521.	Garcia Decl. ¶ 36 (erroneously numbered 32 on page 7)
62.	The footage from Officer Chomuk's body worn camera that fairly and accurately depicts the events that occurred in the fourth floor hallway on February 3, 2024, from the viewpoint of the camera affixed to his chest is attached to his declaration as Exhibit A . It was produced as DEF2504.	Chomuk Decl. ¶ 4

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Based on the foregoing undisputed facts, which have been construed in the light most favorable to Plaintiffs, the Court makes the following conclusions of law:

1. This Court has jurisdiction of this action, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331(a) and 1343.
2. Defendant Caleb Garcia Alamilla ("Defendant Garcia") acted under color of law as an employee of the City of Los Angeles, in his capacity as a Police Officer.
3. Based on the evidence presented, no rational jury could find beyond a preponderance of evidence that Defendant Garcia used unreasonable or excessive force on the Decedent, Jason Maccani, under the circumstances where Maccani charged towards responding Officers with an object that reasonably appeared to be a knife clenched in his fist. *See Graham v. Connor*, 490 U.S. 386, 397 (1989).

1 4. Based on the evidence presented, no rational jury could find beyond a
2 preponderance of evidence that Defendant Garcia violated 42 U.S.C. § 1983 by
3 failing to provide medical care. The record demonstrates that Officers summoned
4 medical assistance within approximately 70 seconds of lethal force being deployed
5 and continuously rendered medical aid to Maccani until the rescue ambulance
6 arrived. *See Tatum v. Cty. & Cnty. of San Francisco*, 441 F.3d 1090 (9th Cir. 2006).

7 5. Plaintiff Alexandra Rasey-Smith lacks standing to assert a violation
8 under 42 U.S.C. § 1983 for the alleged deprivation of her substantive due process
9 rights by Defendants Garcia and City of Los Angeles because a spouse cannot
10 recover under this theory.

11 6. Based on the evidence presented, no rational jury could find beyond a
12 preponderance of evidence that the conduct of Defendant Garcia “shocks the
13 conscience” in violation of 42 U.S.C. § 1983 (substantive due process) because he
14 did not act with a purpose to harm Maccani unrelated to legitimate law enforcement
15 objectives. *See Napouk v. L.V. Metro. Police Dep’t*, 123 F.4th 906 (9th Cir. 2024).

16 7. Based on the evidence presented, Defendant Garcia is entitled to
17 qualified immunity because (1) he did not violate Maccani’s constitutional rights;
18 (2) any mistakes of fact or law Defendant Garcia may have made were reasonable;
19 and (3) his actions did not violate clearly established law. *See Saucier v. Katz*, 533
20 U.S. 194, 200 (2001).

21 8. Based on the evidence presented, no rational jury could find beyond a
22 preponderance of evidence that Defendant Garcia committed a battery upon
23 Maccani because Defendant Garcia used objectively reasonable force based on the
24 facts and circumstances which he believed confronted him. *See Hernandez v. City of*
25 *Pomona*, 46 Cal. 4th 501, 512-15 (2009); and *Garner*, 471 U.S. at 3, 11-12.

26 9. Based on the evidence presented, no rational jury could find beyond a
27 preponderance of evidence that Defendant Garcia violated decedent Maccani’s
28 Section 52.1 rights because (1) there is no evidence that Garcia violated any

1 constitutional right of Maccani's; and (2) there is no evidence that Garcia acted with
2 the requisite specific intent to violate any of Maccani's constitutional rights. *See*
3 *Venegas v. Cnty. of Los Angeles*, 153 Cal.App.4th 1230, 1242 (2007).

4 10. Based on the evidence presented, no rational jury could find beyond a
5 preponderance of evidence that Defendant City of Los Angeles is variously liable
6 for Defendant Garcia's alleged violation of Section 52.1 because Plaintiff cannot
7 establish the Section 52.1 claim against Defendant Garcia. *See Zelig v. Cty. of Los*
8 *Angeles*, 27 Cal. 4th 1112, 1131 (2002).

9 11. Plaintiff Alexandra Rasey-Smith lacks standing to recover for battery,
10 negligence, or violation of the Bane Act in her individual capacity. *See Cal. Code*
11 *Civ. Proc. section 377.30*.

12 12. Judgment shall be entered in Defendant's favor consistent herewith,
13 with reasonable costs to be awarded in an amount according to proof.

14 13. The only remaining claim in this action is the state law negligence
15 claim asserted by the Decedent's Estate in the Fifth Cause of Action.

16 IT IS SO ORDERED.

17 Dated: _____

Honorable Michelle Williams Court
United States District Judge